



MUCKLENEUK & LUKASRAND
Property Owners and Residents Association

2023/08/24

To: All Residents concerned

RE: FEEDBACK ON THE INVESTIGATION INTO THE VIABILITY OF IMPLEMENTING MONITORED ACCESS FOR THE AREA AS PER A RESOLUTION APPROVED AT THE 2022 AGM.

Objective:

An approved resolution was given at the 2022 AGM to investigate the viability and feasibility of monitored access for Muckleneuk and Lukasrand and to present the findings to the community before implementation.

Factors considered:

The following factors were considered during the investigation:

1. Traffic flow;
2. Pedestrian routes and available sidewalks;
3. Hospital and school access points and traffic;
4. Crime hot spots;
5. MHSI cameras located in Muckleneuk;
6. Costs to each property owner;
7. Timeframe for implementation;
8. Minimum percentage of resident contribution required to submit application to City of Tshwane.

Process to date:

When the mandate was approved, we appointed a task team for this project known as the "One Safe Community Project Committee" with the sole purpose to investigate whether controlled monitored access is at all an option for our area considering the hospital, school, businesses and embassies in our area.

Over the past 12 months this task team tirelessly investigated and debated the most suitable option to achieve controlled monitored access. The task team process entailed the following:

1. **STAKEHOLDER ENGAGEMENT** - Meetings were held with various stakeholders like Crawford College, Zuid Afrikaans Hospital and Muckleneuk Hill Security Initiative (MHSI) as well as other smaller interested parties within the area.
2. **SERVICE PROVIDER IDENTIFICATION** – Mr Jan Malan and his company STREET SAFE, was identified and consulted as an expert in the field with a track record of several successful controlled monitored access implementations. Several meetings and draft plans were compiled containing costings and proposed manned entrances, motorized sliding gates, locked gates, street closures and 24hr guards. The numerous options were discussed and amended towards ensuring the best possible fit for our area.

3. A high level (*pro bono*) traffic count study was done by Street Safe to prepare a draft plan and costing framework. However, to determine a lower monthly cost to each resident, funds needed to be raised for an in-depth traffic study by a traffic engineer. Since the resignation of the committee head, the funds could not be raised without the focus and determination that this project required.

Proposed Costs for controlled monitored access:

The total cost provided by Street Safe as at 23May 2023 is as follows:

1. Formal traffic count study: R 45,000-00
2. Preparation work for the application: R 135,120-00
3. Application cost: R 605,710-00
4. Construction: R 6,965,697-00
5. Monthly operational cost: R 389,093-00

These costs were based on the following draft plan:

1. Manned entrances: 7
2. 24hour guards: 6
3. Motorized sliding gates: 3
4. Locked gates: 2
5. Steel palisade fencing: 215m

The City of Tshwane requires a minimum support of 70% of total properties (erven) in the area when submitting the application to be considered. The payment model, proposed by Street Safe, is to have residents contribute a standard amount through debit orders. The debit order will be activated once the 70% commitment from residents are reached and will be effective till construction is finished. This will ensure that the residents are not requested to pay large amounts at certain points in time.

The required 70% amounts to 459 properties to financially commit to R920-00 per month for a minimum of 18 months to finance for the preparation, the application and the construction costs. Once the construction has been completed the monthly fee can decrease to a minimum of R850-00 per month per property based on the fee structure in May 2023, but it can also increase due to unforeseen circumstances outside our control.

Should more than 70% of the total properties financially contribute, the monthly fee would decrease but conversely, should less than 70% of the total properties contribute after the approval, the fees would need to increase to cover the costs associated with the construction.

Project assessment:

With a total capital expense of R 7,571,406-00, we considered the following factors:

1. Expenses toward the preparation and submission of the application must be covered by the financial commitment of 70% of the residents, in writing, by signing a debit order before proceeding. Without the commitment the project cannot go ahead;
2. All expenses paid towards the preparation and submission of the application is done at risk and residents will not be refunded should the application is denied;
3. The time period for execution is 18-months excluding the time it takes to achieve the 70% commitment. The suggested period to achieve the 70% commitment is 6-12months which takes the project execution to a period of 24-30months (2-3years).
4. Residents who committed financially to the project may move out of the area and new residents may opt not to support the project. It follows that the application may be forfeited due to the 70% requirement not being achieved or that the monthly contribution needs to be increased to cover the construction cost.
5. After construction, the risk may arise that some residents stop their monthly contribution towards the monthly operational expense due to financial distress, moving out of the area and new residents may opt not to partake. It follows that the monthly contribution amount would then have to increase for those residents who do contribute to cover the monthly operational expense.
6. The controlled monitored access approval is reviewed by City of Tshwane every 2 years according to current legislation and should the requirements not be met, the City of Tshwane holds the right to request that all gates and closures be removed. It follows that all the funds contributed would then not be refunded to the residents.

Decision on controlled monitored access:

The period of 18 months (or longer) is a concern to us as our crime requires immediate intervention and our decision is that, although controlled monitored access is possible in our area, it will not be the immediate solution that we require. We want to provide a quicker but also effective solution towards our resident's safety.

Proposed solution:

We have engaged with the City of Tshwane regarding alternative solutions and concluded that we will apply to the City of Tshwane to permanently close certain identified streets with a fence contributing towards effective traffic and pedestrian control.

The benefits to this solution is that:

1. There is no 70% minimum requirement;
2. Shorter process;
3. Once approval is obtained from City of Tshwane, we have 10 years to raise the funds for construction;
4. A once-off cost per fence;
5. Every fence can be constructed as funds become available;
6. No renewal is required;

7. Channelling of vehicle and pedestrian traffic to specific entrance and exit points;
8. Decrease of thorough-through traffic;
9. Safer space for pedestrians and children to walk the streets with less traffic;
10. After all the approved streets have been closed, we can consider to apply for controlled monitored access with guards and boomed gates.

We have already engaged with some of the major stakeholders in the area, and, in principle, they are willing to contribute financially towards this phased approach.

Conclusion:

We have thus concluded the investigation of controlled monitored access for Muckleneuk / Lukasrand area. We believe that controlled monitored access, defined as streets that are closed with pedestrian gates, some motorized sliding gates and boomed gates with security guards, is possible for the area and that it can be implemented.

A decision was reached that it is not the quickest solution to our current challenges and that the possibility exists that the minimum requirement of 70% will not be reached. This may or may not include a model of motorised sliding and boomed gates with security guards that will require City Council approval and 70% buy-in. The opportunity remains that once we have closed off some of the streets, as proposed, that if the residents at that stage still wish to pursue controlled monitored access, we can consider applying for it at a later stage.

Next steps:

1. Compile a list of proposed streets to be closed;
2. Do a formal traffic and pedestrian study with a report by a qualified Traffic Engineer. To decrease costs, we suggest MHSI security camera information if available;
3. A formal public participation meeting will be held to discuss the proposed plan and costing;
4. An application will be submitted to City of Tshwane taking into consideration the input from the residents at the public participation meeting, the stakeholders in the area and the traffic study report;
5. The application will be approved / denied a few weeks later. The City of Tshwane can accept the application but exclude / reject some proposed street closures with the approval.
6. Each street closure will be dealt with as an individual project with an individual budget and fund raising initiatives. Once the funds for a "street project" are available, construction can be executed.

We trust that this feedback deems the mandate to "*investigate the possibility of controlled monitored access in our area*" as executed, and that we shall continue with our efforts towards our residential safety during the course of the following months.

Kind Regards

Nico vd Merwe
MLPORA: Chairman

Dean Gillespie
Portfolio Manager: Resident Safety